

CITY OF JACKSONVILLE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMISSION

Proceedings held on Wednesday, October 22, 2014,
commencing at 3:00 p.m., Ed Ball Building, 214 North
Hogan Street, 8th Floor, Jacksonville, Florida, before
Diane M. Tropa, a Notary Public in and for the State of
Florida at Large.

PRESENT:

JOHN ALLMAND, Chair.
BARRY B. UNDERWOOD, Vice Chair.
CORA HACKLEY, Secretary.
J. RICHARD MOORE, JR., Commission Member.
JENNIFER MANSFIELD, Commission Member.
DAVID B. CASE, Commission Member.
ANGELA SCHIFANELLA, Commission Member.

ALSO PRESENT:

JOEL McEACHIN, Planning and Development Dept.
LISA RANSOM, Planning and Development Dept.
AUTUMN MARTINAGE, Planning and Development Dept.
GLORIA BLAKE, Planning and Development Dept.
SUSAN GRANDIN, Office of General Counsel.

- - -

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 PROCEEDINGS
2 October 22, 2014 3:00 p.m.

3 ---
4 THE CHAIRMAN: I want to call this meeting
5 to order.

6 We'll start by verifying a quorum. We
7 have Commissioner Underwood, Commissioner
8 Hackley, Commissioner Case, Commissioner
9 Mansfield and Commissioner Moore here. More
10 than enough for a quorum.

11 Before we go into the approval of the
12 minutes, I want to make a few announcements.
13 If you guys have a cell phone, please put it on
14 mute or vibrate. If you have any side
15 conversation, please take it outside -- outside
16 into the hall. Occasionally, it gets a little
17 loud and our court reporter is unable to hear
18 what the commissioners are saying.

19 We've got speaker cards. If you choose to
20 speak, please fill those out. Those can be
21 found on the table and -- right out that back
22 door there.

23 When you decide to speak, you're going to
24 come up to the microphone, and then you will be
25 asked to give your name and address and be
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 THE CHAIRMAN: Opposed?
2 COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
3 THE CHAIRMAN: By your action, you have
4 approved the minutes from September 24th, 2014,
5 which brings us to the consent agenda.
6 (Commissioner Schifanella enters the
7 proceedings.)

8 THE CHAIRMAN: For the record,
9 Commissioner Schifanella has arrived.
10 And, actually, Commissioner --
11 MS. SCHIFANELLA: I need to recuse myself
12 from this line item on the consent agenda.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Got it. So Commissioner
14 Schifanella will not be voting on the consent
15 agenda because she is an applicant on the
16 consent agenda.

17 Do we have to open it up for a public
18 hearing on consent?

19 MS. GRANDIN: No.

20 THE CHAIRMAN: Does anybody want to -- has
21 everyone reviewed the items on the consent?
22 Does anyone want to pull anything?

23 MS. MANSFIELD: We have to vote on them
24 separately, right?

25 THE CHAIRMAN: No. We're just going to --
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 sworn in. And after that, we're going to ask
2 you, you know, if you have any questions. If
3 you have -- number one, if you have read the
4 staff report and if you have any questions
5 about any of the conditions that may or may
6 not -- may or may not be on your staff report,
7 just as a means of kind of focusing the
8 conversation.

9 So if you have a presentation prepared,
10 please try to save that until after we kind of
11 get through the -- you know, the line items in
12 terms of the conditions and whether or not you
13 accept them or want to chat further about
14 those.

15 That being said, I'd like to see if we can
16 get approval on the minutes.

17 MR. CASE: Mr. Chair, I move that we
18 approval the minutes of September 24th, 2014.

19 MR. MOORE: Second.

20 THE CHAIRMAN: So, Commissioner Case, you
21 have moved that we will approve the minutes
22 from the meeting on September 24th, 2014. It's
23 been seconded.

24 All in favor.

25 COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 she's going to recuse herself from the whole
2 vote, so we're going to have them all at once.

3 MS. MANSFIELD: Oh, okay. I move we
4 approve the consent agenda.

5 MR. CASE: Second.

6 THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Commissioner
7 Mansfield has moved that we approve the consent
8 agenda which comprises of COA-14-664 and
9 COA-14-732.

10 All in favor.

11 COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Opposed?

13 COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)

14 THE CHAIRMAN: Hearing none, you have
15 approved the consent agenda comprising of
16 COA-14-664 and COA-14-732, which brings us
17 to -- it's Item E on our agenda, under historic
18 designations, LM-14-02.

19 MS. MANSFIELD: Did you announce the
20 deferred items already?

21 THE CHAIRMAN: I haven't announced the
22 deferred items.

23 MS. MANSFIELD: I thought you might want
24 to, in case --

25 THE CHAIRMAN: I was going to -- we're
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Page 6

1 going to have a couple different kind of
2 mov- -- a little movement in the agenda. I am
3 going to approach that when we get to the
4 Certificates of Appropriateness.
5 MS. RANSOM: Thank you.
6 The proposed designation of Second
7 Missionary Baptist Church, 954 Kings Road,
8 LM-14-02.
9 The general location is the southeast
10 corner of Kings Road and Interstate 95 in the
11 LaVilla neighborhood, west of downtown
12 Jacksonville. This landmark designation is
13 sponsored by the applicant, Second Missionary
14 Baptist Church.
15 The proposed landmark meets Criteria A,
16 its value as a significant reminder of the
17 cultural, historic -- historical, architectural
18 or archaeological heritage of the city, state
19 or nation. The church has been located as part
20 of this historic neighborhood of LaVilla for
21 more than 160 years.
22 LaVilla itself is -- I think it was
23 predominantly an African-American neighborhood,
24 and it was very central to social, civic and
25 church groups within the African-American
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Page 7

1 community, and the church was a part of that.
2 The church itself overall was very influential
3 as other institutional organizations and
4 business establishments in the LaVilla area.
5 The slide -- I believe it's the next
6 slide. This is the existing building. This
7 is -- this was part of the original church.
8 The original church itself was burned down,
9 unfortunately. It was wooden and also
10 destroyed in the great fire.
11 This was the replacement wood structure
12 that was built and located at 1018 Kings
13 Avenue. The first brick structure was
14 completed in 1930 under the leadership of
15 Pastor/Reverend King David Britt. In 1950, a
16 wing completed the historic edifice.
17 The design of the Second Missionary
18 Baptist Church represents an example of the
19 vernacular or folk adaptation of the late
20 Gothic Revival style as noted -- the next
21 slide -- as noted by steeply pitched gable
22 roofs, the cross-gables, the varied window
23 treatments that you can see in the photo.
24 And also, many times, the exterior of the
25 Gothic Revival style buildings were originally
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Page 8

1 detailed in stone or cast stone trim. Also,
2 you have the massive towers that are evident in
3 the building type that we have existing now.
4 Also, the church, the proposed landmark,
5 meets Criteria D. It is identified with the
6 work of a master builder, designer or architect
7 that was influenced in the development of the
8 city, state or nation.
9 Second Missionary Baptist Church was
10 constructed and probably designed by a noted
11 Jacksonville contractor and designer, James
12 Edward Hutchins.
13 James Hutchins was born in 1890 in
14 George -- in Blakely, Georgia. He attended
15 Savannah State College. He formed his own
16 construction company in the 1930's. Other
17 churches that he built in Jacksonville include
18 St. Paul A.M.E. Church, New Bethel A.M.E.
19 Church, First Born Church of Living God and
20 others. He is recognized as one of the few
21 African-American contractors in Jacksonville
22 that also designed as well as built.
23 And finally, Criteria G, we find that the
24 proposed landmark is suitable for preservation
25 or restoration. We find that there are no
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Page 9

1 significant exterior alterations to the
2 building that would have impacted the character
3 that's defined by the existing structure.
4 There were no major alterations that would --
5 that are impossible or too costly to -- to
6 reverse.
7 The Planning and Development Department
8 finds that the church was -- has been in
9 continuous operation and maintained its -- the
10 construction since 1930.
11 In addition, on January 22nd, 1999, the
12 Florida Department of the State Division of
13 Historical Resources determined that the Second
14 Missionary Baptist Church is a potential -- is
15 potentially eligible for listing with the
16 National Register of Historic Places.
17 Based on the findings of the report, the
18 Planning and Development Department recommends
19 that the Jacksonville Historic Preservation
20 Commission approve the designation of 954 Kings
21 Road, Second Missionary Baptist Church,
22 LM-14-02, as a city of Jacksonville landmark.
23 THE CHAIRMAN: Are there any questions for
24 staff?
25 COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

Page 10

1 THE CHAIRMAN: None. Hearing none, we'll
 2 open it up for a public hearing.
 3 Would anybody like to come up and speak to
 4 this matter?
 5 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 6 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
 7 MS. BLAKE: Reverend, would you please
 8 state your name and address for the record.
 9 REVEREND EMANUEL: Yes. My name is
 10 Reverend Kenneth J. Emanuel, Sr. My address is
 11 2519 Eagle Bay Drive, Orange Park, Florida
 12 32073.
 13 MS. BLAKE: Would you raise your right
 14 hand, please.
 15 REVEREND EMANUEL: (Complies.)
 16 MS. BLAKE: Do you affirm that the
 17 testimony you are about to give is the truth,
 18 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?
 19 REVEREND EMANUEL: Yes, I do.
 20 MS. BLAKE: Thank you.
 21 REVEREND EMANUEL: What I would like to
 22 do -- first of all, let me say, Chairman
 23 Allmand and the Historic Preservation
 24 Commission, it's a pleasure to be here with all
 25 of you. I give my thanks to Ms. Ransom and
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

Page 11

1 Mr. McEachin who have been supportive of our
 2 effort to do this.
 3 Before I say anything else, I would like
 4 to let you know that today, I am here
 5 representing our pastor, Pastor Odell Smith,
 6 Jr., who was unable to be here today, but with
 7 me are some very distinguished members of the
 8 church.
 9 Our Chairman of our Deacon Board, Deacon
 10 Charles Warren; Trustee Sophronia Rainey; and a
 11 historian and many other functions in our
 12 church, he's got a lot of history, walking
 13 history, is Brother Maxwell.
 14 We, obviously, endorse the recommendations
 15 of the staff, and we would just like to say
 16 that the church has a rich history. You may
 17 know from reading the background that turn of
 18 the 19th Century, the members at that time were
 19 all a part of Bethel Baptist, including First
 20 Baptist Church. First Baptist broke off, and
 21 so did Second Baptist, and it's been around
 22 since then.
 23 The building that we are talking about is
 24 still being used. I am currently serving as
 25 Pastor Special Assistant for youth and
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

Page 12

1 young adult matters.
 2 We have great plans to continue the
 3 facility as it is, to restore it and preserve
 4 it and -- through grants and otherwise to
 5 ensure that we can function and participate in
 6 the betterment of our community.
 7 Today, we use the facility for youth
 8 children and college-age services which are
 9 interactive, and we attempt to reach young
 10 people of all scribes who may need
 11 encouragement to ensure that they do not take
 12 the wrong path.
 13 It is a way of reaching them. We -- we
 14 favor using this building, standing on the
 15 shoulders of those who stood before us and the
 16 history that it represents as a motivation or
 17 the jet fuel to propel us to a greater
 18 tomorrow, looking back in order to look forward
 19 to what we need to do to include the great
 20 heritage of that church in the community.
 21 I don't want to take any more of your
 22 time, but I will turn to the members here and
 23 see if I can do that, if anyone wants to say
 24 anything, and we'll be open to any questions
 25 that you might have.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

Page 13

1 MS. SCHIFANELLA: I always like to ask
 2 this question: It's a very -- I'm sorry, it's
 3 a wonderful application. I'm thrilled to see
 4 it. It's one of those buildings that I would
 5 have thought was already a landmark, but
 6 just -- you are well aware of the -- the
 7 constraints that will be placed on the building
 8 and --
 9 REVEREND EMANUEL: Absolutely.
 10 MS. SCHIFANELLA: -- as part of the
 11 process? Okay.
 12 REVEREND EMANUEL: Yeah, I was quite aware
 13 of them, and I think the church is as well.
 14 And I tell you, I had a pretty detailed
 15 discussion with the executive director of the
 16 Jacksonville Historical Society because we're
 17 in the process of pursuing a State grant.
 18 And I read the rules and regulations and
 19 we're prepared to accept them and seek to
 20 restore consistent with those rules. And, of
 21 course, I recognize that those rules have some
 22 exceptions. And we will be here, if we need
 23 to, and we hope that you will act favorably on
 24 those exceptions because we will only come if
 25 it's absolutely necessary. That was just --
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 MS. SCHIFANELLA: Well, we'll --
 2 REVEREND EMANUEL: -- a little levity for
 3 the moment. Okay.
 4 MS. SCHIFANELLA: I guess that's all.
 5 We're trying to make sure you are aware that it
 6 does involve this process.
 7 REVEREND EMANUEL: Absolutely.
 8 MS. SCHIFANELLA: Yeah.
 9 REVEREND EMANUEL: Absolutely.
 10 MS. MANSFIELD: Well, also, I mean, any
 11 exterior work would have to come -- and you
 12 might not have to come in front of this body,
 13 you might be able to have it done
 14 administratively to get a COA, but they are
 15 also a resource for you as well.
 16 So, for example, if you need to repoint
 17 the brick, you can't use the hard mortar of
 18 today. So if you give them a call, they will
 19 be able to tell you what you should look for
 20 and what your contractor should do to do it
 21 right so it doesn't damage the building.
 22 And that's just an example of the stuff.
 23 So look at the staff as a resource and not just
 24 a requirement that you have to go through to
 25 get your exterior preservation work done.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 REVEREND EMANUEL: I sensed that already
 2 because when we contemplated coming here for
 3 this application, someone that used to sit on
 4 your commission used to work for me. And I
 5 called him, and he said please call Joel
 6 McEachin because he will help you out.
 7 And now Ms. Ransom has been very helpful
 8 to us. And we will go back to them and ask
 9 them what we need to do and make sure that we
 10 follow the pathway that's consistent with the
 11 rules and regulations. But I understand, we
 12 might need a COA, and I just want you to be
 13 favorable. Just know that we wouldn't even
 14 consider that unless it was absolutely a need
 15 by necessity.
 16 Thank you very much.
 17 THE CHAIRMAN: Is there anyone else that
 18 would like to speak on this application?
 19 AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
 20 THE CHAIRMAN: Anyone?
 21 AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)
 22 THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Seeing none,
 23 I'll close the public hearing and open it up
 24 for discussion and/or motions.
 25 MS. MANSFIELD: I move that we approve the
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 application with landmark status.
 2 MR. CASE: Second.
 3 MS. HACKLEY: Second.
 4 THE CHAIRMAN: You have moved and it has
 5 been seconded that we shall approve the
 6 landmark status, LM-14-02.
 7 All in favor.
 8 COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
 9 THE CHAIRMAN: Opposed?
 10 COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, you have
 12 approved LM-14-02, which brings us to the
 13 Certificate of Appropriateness portion of our
 14 agenda.
 15 And before we get into that, there's going
 16 to be a couple different kind of things that
 17 move in the agenda, but even before we get to
 18 that, I want to bring maybe some of the
 19 commissioners who -- bring something to light
 20 that maybe some of the commissioners didn't
 21 know about that weren't at the last meeting,
 22 but as we kind of trudge through these, please
 23 be aware that it is -- a request has been made
 24 that the chairman repeat any motion that y'all
 25 make. Okay? So be gentle because I have to,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 you know, wrap my brain around it.
 2 So we've got -- we've had -- we have --
 3 we've had some pretty elaborate motions, and
 4 the request is let's, you know, make them --
 5 and I'm guilty of it, too, but let's make them
 6 as basic as possible. And, you know, that's
 7 allowed us to move actually quicker through the
 8 COAs and give a kind of clear insight to what
 9 we're looking for. So if I'm -- if you hear me
 10 kind of repeating what you just said, that's
 11 why.
 12 MS. MANSFIELD: I just have a question
 13 about the landmark stuff. In our book, we have
 14 a designation of application for something on
 15 Arlington Road? I do.
 16 THE COURT REPORTER: Jennifer, I can
 17 hardly hear you, I'm sorry.
 18 MS. MANSFIELD: Okay. I'll try to speak
 19 up.
 20 THE CHAIRMAN: Joel, are we voting on an
 21 Arlington Road landmark at this meeting?
 22 MR. McEACHIN: (Inaudible). It's got that
 23 little arrow. It probably was the Norman Film
 24 Studio which was the last (inaudible).
 25 THE CHAIRMAN: All right.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300